

— THE EVOLUTION OF THE —

ASEAN

HUMAN RIGHTS MECHANISM

Institutional & Thematic Issues Within

Edited by

Randy Wirasta Nandyatama,
Dio Herdiawan Tobing, and
Shah Suraj Bharat

ASEAN Studies Center UGM is a leading research institution on ASEAN integration based at the Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Universitas Gadjah Mada, Indonesia.

ASEAN Studies Center occasionally publishes academic publications to disseminate research and knowledge. Comments and Questions related to this Book should be directed to aseansc@ugm.ac.id.

**The Evolution of The ASEAN
Human Rights Mechanism**

Institutional and Thematic Issues Within

edited by

Randy Wirasta Nandyatama
Dio Herdiawan Tobing
Shah Suraj Bharat

© 2019 ASEAN STUDIES CENTER
FACULTY OF SOCIAL AND POLITICAL SCIENCES
UNIVERSITAS GADJAH MADA

The Evolution of The ASEAN Human Rights Mechanism:
Institutional and Thematic Issues Within

Editors:

Randy Wirasta Nandyatama
Dio Herdiawan Tobing
Shah Suraj Bharat

ISBN

978-602-71482-6-0

vi + 35; 15 x 21 cm

First Published in November 2019

Published by
ASEAN Studies Center
Faculty of Social and Political Sciences Universitas Gadjah
Mada BC Building 2nd Floor,
Jalan Socio Justicia No. 1, Bulaksumur
Yogyakarta, Indonesia 55281

Contents

List of figures and tables	i
Foreword	ii
About the editors	iv
About the authors	v
1 Introduction: The Human Rights Body of ASEAN	1
DIO HERDIAWAN TOBING	
2 Unlocking the ASEAN Human Rights Mechanism in Achieving a Regional Human Rights System	18
SAIDATUL NADIA ABD AZIZ & SALAWATI MAT BASIR	
3 A Legal Analysis of Cultural Necessity to Complete the Human Rights System in ASEAN	62
KADEK WIWIK INDRAYANTI & NANDA SARASWATI	
4 The Rights of Persons with Disabilities in ASEAN	84
MUHAMMAD AMMAR HIDAYAHTULLOH	
5 The Protection of Refugee Rights Beyond a Legal Approach in Southeast Asia	136
ANNISA D. AMALIA	
6 Algorithmic Governance and the Evolution of the ASEAN Human Rights Mechanism	173
NI KETUT DIVYA KARYZA PUTRI	

7 Regionalization, Not Regionalism: A Way Forward for Upgrading Economic and Developmental Rights in ASEAN SHAH SURAJ BHARAT	211
8 Conclusion: The Future of Human Rights in ASEAN RANDY WIRASTA NANDYATAMA	232

List of figures and tables

- 1.1. List of ASEAN Member States and the Persona of Their Representatives to AICHR 2016-2018 11
- 1.2. Requirements to apply for the position of the Indonesian Representative to ASEAN 12
- 3.1. ASEAN Member states Commitment to International Human Rights Law 56
- 3.2. Contributing Factors to the Ineffectiveness of the ASEAN Human Rights System 69
- 4.1. Total Population and Disabled People Population in ASEAN (≤2007 & 2015) 98
- 4.2. ASEAN Member States' Commitment Toward the CRPD and Its Optional Protocol 99
- 4.3. The Rights of Persons with Disability in the CRPD and ASEAN Member States 111
- 4.4. ASEAN Disability-related Documents 112
- 4.5. Task Force Meetings and Regional Dialogues on Disability Rights in ASEAN 114-115
- 7.1. SDGs in AEC Blueprint 217
- 8.1. Comparison of Southeast Asian Countries' Freedom House Index in 2013 and 2018 242

Foreword

Dafri Agussalim

Executive Director of ASEAN Studies Center

Universitas Gadjah Mada

On 23 October 2019, we celebrate the 10th Anniversary of the ASEAN Intergovernmental Commission on Human Rights (AICHR). It was a historic milestone, when ASEAN agrees to establish a Commission that carries the mandate of human rights promotion and the protection of fundamental freedoms, in conformity with the objectives and purposes of the ASEAN Charter. The AICHR's role in setting the stage for human rights cooperation in ASEAN was, is, and will always be vital. Notably, the Commission was successful in lending its expertise throughout the process of the adoption of the ASEAN Human Rights Declaration in 2012. Moreover, through the work of its Commissioners, the process of human rights standard setting continues to be an important endeavour for the region.

Indonesia continues to encourage for strengthening of the AICHR's role in safeguarding human rights and fundamental freedoms in the region. Indonesia's commitment to human rights in ASEAN is demonstrated primarily through the open and transparent selection of the country's representative to the AICHR. Commissioned by

the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, the government selects the most credible person to represent Indonesia in advancing human rights promotion in ASEAN. In the international fora, Indonesia also contributes to the promotion and protection of human rights through the United Nations Human Rights Council.

Indonesia will continue to work innovatively with other ASEAN Member States and its partners to spearhead the region in moving forward towards a fully people-oriented and people-centered ASEAN. This book is one of the many pieces of evidence that the Indonesia is supportive in working together with the academia in informing the public to enhance regional human rights cooperation, which is vital in strengthening the ASEAN Community.

Finally, I thank the Permanent Mission of the Republic of Indonesia to ASEAN, and the Representative of Indonesia to the AICHR, the Editors; Dr Randy, Mas Dio, and Shah, and all Contributors for having been an excellent partner throughout the drafting of this book. I wish all of you more successes in all your future endeavours.

Jakarta, 30 October 2019

this page is intentionally left blank

About the Editors

RANDY WIRASTA NANDYATAMA

is a Lecturer in the Department of International Relations, Gadjah Mada University, Indonesia. He holds a PhD in International Relations from the University of Melbourne, Australia, and an MSc in International Relations from the S. Rajaratnam School of International Studies, Nanyang Technological University, Singapore. From 2013 to 2015, he was the inaugural Director of the ASEAN Studies Center at the Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Universitas Gadjah Mada. He has now returned to the ASEAN Studies Center as a Senior Researcher and taken up a new role as the Director of the Academic Innovation Unit at the Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Universitas Gadjah Mada. His research interests span International Regimes (esp. ASEAN), China-Southeast Asia relations and human rights studies. One of his recent publications was a book chapter entitled “Institutionalising Human Rights in ASEAN: The Peril of Doxic Subordination” published by Gadjah Mada University Press (2018). He can be reached through email: randy.wirasta@ugm.ac.id

DIO HERDIAWAN TOBING

is an Associate Research Fellow with the ASEAN Studies Center, Universitas Gadjah Mada. He holds an LL.M in Public International Law from Leiden University, the Netherlands, in which he was a recipient of the Dutch Government’s StuNed Scholarship, and a BA in International Relations from Universitas Gadjah Mada (2016). He was also educated at Utrecht University (2015) and Maastricht University (2019), in which he obtained a certificate in

International Human Rights Law and International Law from a Gender Perspective and a certificate in Country Risk Analysis. His fields of interests are Indonesian foreign Policy, ASEAN regionalism, security and geopolitics, and human rights. He has published books, articles and papers on issues relevant to ASEAN and human rights, including refugee rights in Indonesia. Email: dio.herdiawan.t@mail.ugm.ac.id

SHAH SURAJ BHARAT

is an Emerging Markets Researcher and Editor. Now based in Yangon, Myanmar, he was previously a Visiting Research Fellow at the ASEAN Studies Center, Universitas Gadjah Mada, and subsequently worked in editorial for The Jakarta Post and Tenggara Strategics in Jakarta. He holds an MSc in the Political Economy of Emerging Markets from King's College London, in which he graduated at the top of his cohort, and an integrated BA in History from Royal Holloway University of London and the National University of Singapore, in which he was a recipient of the RHUL Research Award.

About the Authors

SAIDATUL NADIA BINTI ABD AZIZ

is a Senior Lecturer at the Faculty of Law, National University of Malaysia. She obtained her doctorate degree in law from the Faculty of Law, National University of Malaysia. Her research is specifically on the ASEAN Economic Community. Her research focuses on the legal challenges faced by ASEAN member states in order to achieve development in the region. Her research shows

disparities in legal provisions have created barriers to making liberalization a reality. Her research has provided deep discussion on other forms of regional integration, such as the EU, and argued for best practices that could be used by ASEAN in achieving liberalization and ensuring national development. She has also worked and presented on papers mainly on ASEAN, discussing issues regarding labor, media diplomacy, education, foreign investment and the legal systems in ASEAN.

SALAWATI MAT BASIR

is an Associate Professor at the Faculty of Law, National University of Malaysia, and the Legal Adviser of the National University of Malaysia. She obtained her doctorate degree in law from the Faculty of Law, National University of Malaysia. Her research focuses on international development law and regional integration, especially ASEAN integration.

KADEK WIWIK INDRAYANTI

is a Lecturer in the Law Department of Universitas Merdeka Malang. She obtained her Bachelor and Doctoral degree from Brawijaya University, Malang, Indonesia, and her MSc from Mississippi State University, the United States. She specializes in the sociology of law and human rights. Her dissertation was entitled “Legal Protection for Interfaith Marriage Among Citizenship From a Legal Pluralism Perspective”. In the Law Department, she teaches subjects including law and human rights, research methods, introduction to jurisprudence as well as law and society. Besides teaching she also does research funded by Kemenristek dikti of Indonesia. She is also a member of Collaborative Knowledge Net Working Indonesia.

NANDA SARASWATI

graduated from Brawijaya University, Indonesia, majoring in International Law (2009) and received a master's degree from the University of Indonesia (2012) majoring in Transnational Law. Since 2013, Nanda has served as a lecturer at the Faculty of Law, Brawijaya University, under the International Law Department. She teaches courses such as international law, introduction to the Indonesian legal system, human rights law and Pancasila. Nanda is also active at the Center of Human Rights and Democracy, which often holds events in association with national human rights organizations. Her field of research is related to international human rights law, freedom of religion and freedom of expression.

MUHAMMAD AMMAR HIDAYAHTULLOH

holds a bachelor of political science from Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta. His interests include gender, environmental and ASEAN studies. Currently, he is an assistant lecturer on gender and politics, and international relations in Southeast Asia. He is also a researcher at the ASEAN Studies Centre, Universitas Muhammadiyah, Indonesia. His chapter "Strategi ASEAN dalam Pengarusutamaan Gender dalam Mewujudkan Kesetaraan Gender di Asia Tenggara" was published in the book "Masyarakat ASEAN: Problematika, Tantangan dan Strategi" in 2018.

ANNISA D. AMALIA

is a Teaching Associate at the Department of International Relations, Universitas Indonesia. She recently obtained her master's degree in International Relations from the University of Melbourne with the Australia Awards Scholarship. Her interests include forced migration,

human rights and gender issues in global politics. Her previous work has mainly focussed on the intersection of these issues in Southeast Asia. For her master's thesis, she examined the discursive terrain of humanitarianism during the Rohingya refugee crisis by comparing Western and Southeast Asian newspapers. By engaging in the academia, she aspires to contribute to advancing refugee protection throughout Indonesia, Southeast Asia and the rest of the globe. Annisa is also passionate about volunteering. While studying for her master's degree, she joined Crossing Borders Melbourne, an organization educating people about forced migration and helping asylum seekers and refugees integrate into Australian society.

Ni Ketut Divya Karyza Putri

is a third year undergraduate student at the Department of International Relations, Universitas Gadjah Mada, focussing on International Political Economy. In July 2018, she joined the Embassy of Indonesia in Canberra, Australia, as an intern in the Economic Affairs Division where she wrote daily reports on the dynamics of Indonesia-Australia economic relations in light of the Indonesia-Australia Comprehensive Economic Partnership Agreement. She is currently an exchange student at Sciences Po, France, where she studies surveillance, algorithmic law and governance, as well as the economics and decision-making of the European Union.

On the occasion of the 10th Anniversary

of

*ASEAN Intergovernmental
Commission on Human Rights*

~

**The Evolution of The ASEAN
Human Rights Mechanism:**
Institutional and Thematic Issues Within

~

presented by

*ASEAN Studies Center
Universitas Gadjah Mada*